

**REPORT OF THE PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND APPROPRIATIONS
COMMITTEE OF THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES ON OUR DELIBERATIONS
ON THE MINISTRY OF NATIONAL SECURITY**

Members of this Honourable House are reminded that on March 27, 2008, on a motion moved by the Leader of the House, the following resolution was passed by the House of Representatives:

BE IT RESOLVED that notwithstanding Standing Order No. 68(3) and in accordance with Standing Order No. 73A this Honourable House appoint a Public Administration and Appropriations Committee comprising the following Members:

Dr. Kenneth McNeill – Chairman

Hon. Robert Montague

Hon. Michael Stern

Mr. Ernest Smith

Dr. St. Aubyn Bartlett

Mr. Desmond Mair

Mr. Franklyn Witter

Mr. Tarn Peralto

Mr. Othneil Lawrence

Mr. Fitz Jackson

Mr. Phillip Paulwell

Dr. Morais Guy

Rev. Ronald Thwaites

Dr. Donald Duncan

Mr. Ian Hayles

Members are also reminded that on October 28, 2008, this Honourable House passed a resolution amending the membership of the committee to include Mrs. Natalie Neita-Headley in place of Mr. Fitz Jackson.

The committee's terms of reference as set out in Standing Order 73A are as follows:

The Public Administration and Appropriations Committee shall have the duty of—

- (a) examining budgetary expenditure of Government agencies to ensure that expenditure is done in accordance with parliamentary approval;
- (b) monitoring expenditure as it occurs and keeping the Parliament informed of how the Budget is being implemented; and
- (c) enquiring into the administration of the Government to determine hindrances to efficiency and to make recommendations to the Government for improvement of public administration.

Your committee held a single meeting with representatives of the Ministry of National Security on January 28, 2009. We also received guidance from the Deputy Financial Secretary with responsibility for Public Expenditure from the Ministry of Finance, Mrs. Rolda Grey. We now have the honour to present our findings and recommendations.

INTRODUCTION

Several critical functions fall within the purview of the Ministry of National Security, whose mandate is to facilitate the maintenance of law and order, protect Jamaica against internal and external threats, ensure the safety of border control and punish and rehabilitate offenders. As such, the Ministry has charge of the Jamaica Defence Force, the Police Department and the Department of Correctional Services. Additionally, as regards general government services, the Ministry has responsibility for elections for the current financial year, for at the time of preparation of the Estimates of Expenditure, the incumbent Minister was also the Leader of Government Business in the House of Representatives. However, the Permanent Secretary indicated that their presentation would not include an analysis of expenditure at the Electoral Office of Jamaica due to the subsequent change in the leadership of the Ministry.

In our deliberations, your committee became aware of several problematic issues, including the need for training and recruitment in order to address a deficiency in numbers in the Jamaica Constabulary Force and certain key administrative departments in the Ministry itself. We also considered the question of complementing conventional law enforcement measures with social intervention so as to enhance their long term efficacy.

Your committee was also informed that there were difficulties relating to physical infrastructure at the Ministry and its various departments. Among these were the inadequacy of existing police stations, the lack of barrack rooms for officers of the Jamaica Defence Force and the pending relocation of the Firearms Authority. Mobility was also a major challenge for the law enforcement agencies, as motor vehicles were in short supply.

Having considered the facts presented to us, we have devised recommendations in respect of the matters mentioned above as well as other issues relating to law enforcement and the Ministry in general. These include endorsements of requests made for funding for certain ventures as well as the development of mechanisms to support planned development initiatives.

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

BUDGET

At the time of the meeting, the Ministry had an overall balance of \$5,028,468,000 on their total allocation of \$29,331,496,000. Your committee was however informed by representatives of the Ministry that there was a shortfall in the funding that had been made available to them in the initial budget, as a result of which the Jamaica Defence Force, the Jamaica Constabulary Force and the Department of Correctional Services had outstanding commitments. We were further informed that based on the provision in the Supplementary Estimates of Expenditure, the Jamaica Defence Force would carry its debts forward into the 2009-2010 financial year.

Your committee therefore recommends that provision be made in the budget for the coming year to allow the Jamaica Defence Force to discharge its existing financial obligations.

DECLINE IN REVENUE FROM PASSPORT SALES

The Permanent Secretary reported that there had been a decline in revenues to the Passport, Immigration and Citizenship Division due to a reduction in the number of applicants for passports and that it would not be feasible to offset the resulting deficit by reducing the number of persons employed to the department as the staff was small. Consequently, the Ministry had made a Cabinet submission requesting an increase in the fees charged for other services provided by the division, such as applications for citizenship and for extensions of the time granted to visitors, some of which were provided free of charge. While realising that any increase in fees in the existing economic climate will be looked upon with disfavour, your committee also recognises that a shortfall in income from this source could worsen the financial challenges faced by the Ministry.

Your committee therefore recommends that consideration be given to the granting of the increases requested in the relevant Cabinet submission.

RECRUITMENT AND TRAINING OF PERSONNEL

The Ministry of National Security

The Permanent Secretary revealed that in addition to the support that was given by the Attorney General's Chambers in providing legal opinions, the Ministry required that an internal legal unit be established, as this was deemed critical to policy support. The personnel employed to the unit would be involved in the preparation of Cabinet submissions and in matters relating to the legislative framework within which the Ministry operated. An attempt had been made to recruit legal officers, but this had failed, as qualified candidates had expressed unwillingness to accept the remuneration package that the Ministry had been able to offer.

Your committee therefore recommends that provision be made in the budget for the 2009-2010 fiscal year for the recruitment of legal officers and other members of staff for the Ministry's policy directorate.

The Jamaica Constabulary Force

Your committee learnt that the difficulty encountered by the police in enforcing the laws of the land was exacerbated by a severe shortage of officers. We were informed that while the establishment included provision for 12000 policemen and women, only 8300 of the posts were occupied and that number was declining due to an annual attrition rate of between 280 and 300 persons. The inadequacy of the training facilities that ought to enable the replacement of these persons also contributed to the problem. Moreover, the high-risk nature of the job made it difficult to attract potential recruits.

Your committee was pleased to be informed of a salary adjustment that would help to mitigate the fear of physical harm that deterred potential candidates from enlisting. Moreover, we were told that a project for the upgrading of the Police Academy at Twickenham Park, as well as the implementation of a modular training programme that would allow that facility to be supplemented through the use of other institutions during the summer holidays, would facilitate a 100% increase in the number of persons who graduated annually, which was 250 at present. Details regarding the upgrading of Twickenham Park are found in the section of this report that addresses physical infrastructure.

Your committee was of the view that a sustainable method of improving the outcome of the JCF's recruitment efforts was needed. In particular, we felt that it would be helpful to seek to identify potential candidates while they were still involved in the formal education system and to take steps to prepare them for a career in law enforcement through scholarships, holiday training programmes and other supporting activities. Members of the committee reported that a similar strategy was employed to good effect in the United States. Despite some Members' concern that the young participants might be singled out for discriminatory treatment by their peers due

to stigma, we concluded that this was not an insurmountable challenge but an opportunity to alter the cultural sensibilities of the nation's youth where such matters were concerned. Moreover, we were told that both male and female students could participate, since the JCF was fast becoming gender neutral.

Your committee therefore recommends that a recruitment programme for law enforcement personnel be undertaken in secondary and post secondary institutions.

The Jamaica Defence Force

Being aware that members of the Jamaica Defence Force supported the Jamaica Constabulary Force in joint law enforcement operations and that their participation sometimes helped to restore calm to troubled communities, members of your committee were eager to see this continue. Nevertheless, we were concerned about the perception that persisted among the populace that such joint operations represented a heightened threat of danger to civilians because JDF personnel were conditioned to kill while the training provided to members of the police force enabled them to interact with citizens without depriving them of their lives. As such, some members were of the view that soldiers should receive training in dealing with civilians.

Your committee was informed that the existing curriculum for the Jamaica Defence Force included training in the provision of aid to the civil power. Furthermore, we were told that officers of the JDF were involved in supervising inmates at the Horizon Park correctional facility and received training in custodial care. Nevertheless, while not wishing to compromise the core curriculum for members of the JDF, we were in agreement that soldiers who would take part in joint operations should be adequately prepared to carry out the relevant duties with efficiency.

Your committee recommends that the training programme for members of the JDF include a module designed to enhance their capacity to interact positively with civilians while participating in joint operations.

PHYSICAL INFRASTRUCTURE

Current and Prospective Projects

Your committee learnt that the refurbishing of the Area 3 Headquarters in Mandeville was 100% complete; the Central Police Station, 95% complete; identification parade rooms at Mandeville and Ocho Rios were both 97% complete; the installation and refurbishment of buildings for the Centre for the Investigation of Sexual Offences and Child Abuse, 81% complete; the dormitory building at Elletson Road, 44% complete; the shooting range, 95% complete; and the Central Police Station, 99% complete. There were also other projects which were slated for implementation in the last quarter of the 2008-2009 financial year or early in the 2009-2010 financial year.

The Jamaica Police Academy

Your committee learnt that the refurbishing of the Jamaica Police Academy at Twickenham Park, which would increase the number of persons who graduated annually, had been delayed because the Parish Council's approval, which had been sought some six months previously, had not yet been granted. However, the Permanent Secretary indicated that the National Contracts Commission had approved the contract, the Cabinet submission was being prepared, some funding had been received and was still available, and the Mayor had since indicated that the requisite approval would be granted in short order.

Refurbishing of Police Stations and other facilities

The Permanent Secretary indicated that the Ministry had benefited from the recent adjustment to the monetary thresholds for the monitoring of contracts in that they were able to make minor repairs to their facilities in a shorter period. According to the website of the Office of the Contractor General, this adjustment took effect on November 20, 2008 and stipulated that prior approval of the National Contracts Commission would no longer be required for contracts that valued less than J\$10 million. Also, several projects for the upgrading of police stations and other facilities were in progress. Nevertheless, throughout the Ministry there were difficulties

with larger projects that involved new construction or refurbishment, due to various constraints such as a lack of funding or delayed building approvals.

The Falmouth Police Station and the Port Maria Police Station

The Permanent Secretary indicated that work on the Falmouth Police Station had been delayed due to a legal issue involving the contractor. He declined to discuss the matter further because of its delicate nature but indicated that it was being addressed by the Attorney General and the consultants in the Ministry. Similarly, work on the Port Maria Police Station had stalled because the acquisition of land had been impeded by issues relating to the probate of a will.

The Malvern Police Station

Your committee was informed that the building that housed both the Malvern Police Station and the Malvern Courthouse had sustained severe damage in Hurricane Dean and it would not be feasible to repair it. Consequently, a proposal encompassing the requirements of the police station and the courthouse was under consideration by the Ministry, in conjunction with the Ministry of Justice, and the project was to be initiated in the 2009-2010 financial year.

Your committee recommends that this project be given priority attention in the coming fiscal year since the Malvern Courthouse serves many citizens, including elderly and disabled persons, and the police station is essential to the maintenance of law and order in the area.

The Department of Correctional Services

Your committee was informed that financial constraints hindered the maintenance and repair of certain correctional facilities. Notwithstanding, some cost savings had been realised in respect of maintenance, thanks to ongoing work on the part of inmates and members of staff. Furthermore, projects for the phased rebuilding of the Armadale Juvenile Correctional Centre for Girls and the

Montpelier Correctional Facility were in the planning stage and the pre-qualification process in respect of Phase 1 of the Transformation Centre at Tamarind Farm had culminated in the identification of a contractor. The Tamarind Farm Centre would assist in the rehabilitation of between 150 and 180 youthful first-time offenders.

Remand and correctional facilities for boys and girls

Your committee was informed that additional remand and juvenile correctional facilities for boys and girls were needed, as girls were being held at Fort Augusta, which had been sold to the Port Authority, and boys at the Horizon Park remand centre. We were further informed that there were plans to establish a juvenile correctional centre for girls at Rio Cobre and to use Armadale exclusively as a remand facility for girls. In addition, a juvenile correction centre and a remand centre for boys would be established at Montpelier.

Remand and correctional centres for adults

Your committee found that there was a need for increased capacity and additional staffing to house and care for adult offenders. We were told that there was space at the Horizon Park remand centre to accommodate twice the number of persons who were there at present, but a shortage of personnel had made it impracticable for the vacant spaces to be occupied. We were further informed that there was a proposal to establish a remand centre for adults in the central part of the island and another in the West. Lands had been identified at Amity Hall, St. Catherine, and the requisite surveys had been carried out, but the Ministry was awaiting approval for the sale of an additional 200 acres by the board of the Agricultural Development Corporation.

Your committee therefore recommends that provision be made in the budget for the employment of additional personnel at the Horizon Park Remand Centre.

We further recommend that steps be taken to expedite the transfer of lands at Amity Hall for constructing a remand centre in the area.

The Jamaica Defence Force

Your committee was told that there was a deficiency in barrack room accommodations for members of the JDF. We also noted that the facility at New Castle, which had traditionally provided accommodation for some officers and had been maintained by them, had fallen into disrepair. We received the explanation that significant work was needed there because the roof contained asbestos, whose carcinogenic properties had become known long after the construction of the buildings there, and as such, it needed to be replaced. We were told that a plan for renovation of the property was in place, but the passage of Hurricane Ivan, and then Hurricane Dean, had resulted in a delay.

Your committee recommends that assistance be sought from the private sector, players in the tourism industry, and the National Heritage Trust and other bodies with an interest in such matters for the restoration of New Castle.

Relocation of the Firearms Licensing Authority

Your committee learnt that there was an urgent need for the relocation of the Firearms Licensing Authority, as the owners of the building that was used for the purpose wished to regain possession of the property and had given notice of their intention to do so. We were told that two alternative Government-owned sites had been identified, but it would take up to six months for the relocation to be complete.

In view of the urgency of the situation, your committee recommends that steps be taken to shorten the time required for the provision of a suitable, permanent location for the Firearms Licensing Authority.

MOTOR VEHICLES

The Jamaica Constabulary Force

Your committee found that the Jamaica Constabulary Force faced major challenges where mobility was concerned. For example, we were told by the Deputy Commissioner of Police that, at the very least, 1600 vehicles were required to allow the police force to function efficiently, but the existing fleet consisted of only 1200 units, more than fifty percent of which were over ten years old. As such, the older vehicles had to be replaced and 400 additional vehicles were needed. We were informed that an allocation made for the purchase of those 400 vehicles in the 2008-2009 budget had been depleted, as a portion of the funds had been put towards the purchase of armoured vehicles, for which provision had not been made. A three-year replacement programme had been established, in view of the age of the fleet. The National Contracts Commission had approved two contracts for the purchase of twin cab pick-up trucks and large sport utility vehicles for use by the Jamaica Constabulary Force. Additionally, a proposal for the acquisition of small and large patrol cars and fifteen- and thirty-seat buses was to be reviewed by the National Contracts Commission and submitted to Cabinet for approval.

Your committee recommends that the Jamaica Constabulary Force be given the support required to enable them to purchase patrol cars and other vehicles, as this would alleviate the problems encountered in some constituencies due to the inability of the police to arrive at crime scenes in good time.

INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATIONS TECHNOLOGY

Your committee found that the Ministry had made much progress in the area of information technology. For instance, they were in the process of implementing a digital communications system that would reduce reliance on the public telephone and data transfer services. A submission had been made for the acquisition of equipment for personnel and vehicles, including police vehicles and JDF aircraft. The Department of Correctional Services would be included in the programme at a later stage.

The Ministry was also in the process of purchasing additional automatic fingerprinting apparatus. Moreover, closed circuit televisions had been installed in May Pen and there were plans for others to be mounted at three locations.

Some members were of the view that it was important to place greater emphasis on the use of technology, as against human capacity, in the fight against crime, as this strategy had been successfully employed in other jurisdictions. However, your committee had previously received information from the Ministry of Transport and Works regarding the ineffectiveness of closed circuit televisions in curtailing the activity of illegal taxi operators in the vicinity of the Half Way Tree Transport Centre due to the lack of personnel to carry out enforcement. We were therefore convinced that technological innovation would be useless without the necessary human resources. In that regard, we wish to reiterate our recommendations in respect of increasing the number of persons in the Jamaica Constabulary Force.

SUPPLEMENTING TRADITIONAL CRIME FIGHTING STRATEGIES WITH SOCIAL INTERVENTION

Your committee was of the view that traditional crime fighting strategies needed to be complemented with social intervention. We were therefore heartened by the revelation that the first phase of the Citizens Security and Justice Project had been successful. Specifically, there had been significant declines in serious crimes such as homicide, as well as other crimes such as robberies, in the communities in which it had been implemented. Additionally, 125 young men had been relocated from the August Town community and had become involved in vocational and life skills training in the Mona area. Members of the committee were eager to see the project continue beyond 2009, as they had witnessed its positive effects in their constituencies. We were informed that Phase 2 of the programme was being reviewed in order to determine whether it would be sustained beyond this year. We were also told that the Government had signalled its intention to maintain the project by formally requesting assistance from the Inter-American Development Bank.

Your committee therefore recommends that the necessary provision be put in place to ensure the continuity of the Citizens Security and Justice Project.

GENERAL CONCERNS

The Role of the Jamaica Constabulary Force in the Restoration of Downtown, Kingston

In our deliberations on the role of the law enforcement arm of the Ministry of National Security, your committee considered its implications for the policy position of the present administration regarding the restoration of Downtown, Kingston. We were of the view that efforts to encourage investment in the city must be supported by an intense and sustained drive to rid the area of the scourge of crime, including extortion, which deterred some investors from establishing business ventures there.

Your committee therefore recommends the implementation of a strategy to support the Government's policy for the restoration of Downtown, Kingston.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Your committee wishes to express gratitude to the representatives of the Ministry of National Security and the Ministry of Finance and the Public Service for their contribution to our deliberations. Thanks are also extended to the Clerk to the Houses and staff for their administrative and other support.

Houses of Parliament

March 2009

APPENDIX A – ATTENDANCE

1 meeting

	Present	Absent	Apology
Dr. Kenneth McNeill – Chairman	1	-	-
Hon. Robert Montague	-	1	-
Mr. Michael Stern	1	-	-
Mr. Ernest Smith	-	1	1
Dr. St. Aubyn Bartlett	1	-	-
Mr. Desmond Mair	-	1	1
Mr. Franklyn Witter	1	-	-
Mr. Tarn Peralto	-	1	-
Mr. Othneil Lawrence	1	-	-
Mrs. Natalie Neita-Headley	-	1	-
Mr. Phillip Paulwell	1	-	-
Dr. Morais Guy	1	-	-
Rev. Ronald Thwaites	-	1	-
Dr. Donald Duncan	1	-	-

Mr. Ian Hayles

-

1

-

SIGNATURES

.....

Dr. Kenneth McNeill

.....

Mr. Othneil Lawrence

.....

Hon. Robert Montague

.....

Mr. Phillip Paulwell

.....

Hon. Michael Stern

.....

Dr. Morais Guy

.....

Mr. Ernest Smith

.....

Rev. Ronald Thwaites

.....

Dr. St. Aubyn Bartlett

.....

Dr. Donald K. Duncan

.....

Mr. Desmond Mair

.....

Mr. Ian Hayles

.....

Mr. Franklyn Witter

.....

Mrs. Natalie Neita-Headley

.....

Mr. Tarn Peralto